

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

CIVIL ACTION NUMBER:

IN RE: VALSARTAN PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION 19-md-02875

STATUS CONFERENCE via ZOOM

Mitchell H. Cohen Building & U.S. Courthouse
4th & Cooper Streets
Camden, New Jersey 08101
February 23, 2023
Commencing at 2:00 p.m.

B E F O R E: THE HONORABLE ROBERT B. KUGLER
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

A P P E A R A N C E S:

MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC
BY: ADAM M. SLATER, ESQUIRE
103 Eisenhower Parkway
Roseland, New Jersey 07068
For the Plaintiffs

HONIK LLC
BY: RUBEN HONIK, ESQUIRE
1515 Market Street, Suite 1100
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 191032
For the Plaintiffs

Ann Marie Mitchell, Official Court Reporter
AnnMarie_Mitchell@njd.uscourts.gov
(856) 576-7018

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript
produced by computer-aided transcription.

1 **A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):**

2
3 SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM LLP
4 BY: JESSICA DAVIDSON MILLER, ESQUIRE
5 1440 New York Avenue, N.W.
6 Washington, DC 20005
7 For the Defendants, Princeton Pharmaceuticals,
8 Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and Zhejiang Huahai
9 Pharmaceuticals Ltd.

10
11
12 GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
13 BY: GREGORY E. OSTFELD, ESQUIRE
14 77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3100
15 Chicago, Illinois 60601
16 For the Defendants, Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.,
17 Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Actavis LLC,
18 and Actavis Pharma, Inc.

19
20
21 **ALSO PRESENT:**

22
23 LORETTA SMITH, ESQUIRE
24 Judicial Law Clerk to The Honorable Robert B. Kugler
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
8010
8011
8012
8013
8014
8015
8016
8017
8018
8019
8020
8021
8022
8023
8024
8025
8026
8027
8028
8029
8030
8031
8032
8033
8034
8035
8036
8037
8038
8039
8040
8041
8042
8043
8044
8045
8046
8047
8048
8049
8050
8051
8052
8053
8054
8055
8056
8057
8058
8059
8060
8061
8062
8063
8064
8065
8066
8067
8068
8069
8070
8071
8072
8073
8074
8075
8076
8077
8078
8079
8080
8081
8082
8083
8084
8085
8086
8087
8088
8089
8090
8091
8092
8093
8094
8095
8096
8097
8098
8099
80100
80101
80102
80103
80104
80105
80106
80107
80108
80109
80110
80111
80112
80113
80114
80115
80116
80117
80118
80119
80120
80121
80122
80123
80124
80125
80126
80127
80128
80129
80130
80131
80132
80133
80134
80135
80136
80137
80138
80139
80140
80141
80142
80143
80144
80145
80146
80147
80148
80149
80150
80151
80152
80153
80154
80155
80156
80157
80158
80159
80160
80161
80162
80163
80164
80165
80166
80167
80168
80169
80170
80171
80172
80173
80174
80175
80176
80177
80178
80179
80180
80181
80182
80183
80184
80185
80186
80187
80188
80189
80190
80191
80192
80193
80194
80195
80196
80197
80198
80199
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80300
80301
80302
80303
80304
80305
80306
80307
80308
80309
80310
80311
80312
80313
80314
80315
80316
80317
80318
80319
80320
80321
80322
80323
80324
80325
80326
80327
80328
80329
80330
80331
80332
80333
80334
80335
80336
80337
80338
80339
80340
80341
80342
80343
80344
80345
80346
80347
80348
80349
80350
80351
80352
80353
80354
80355
80356
80357
80358
80359
80360
80361
80362
80363
80364
80365
80366
80367
80368
80369
80370
80371
80372
80373
80374
80375
80376
80377
80378
80379
80380
80381
80382
80383
80384
80385
80386
80387
80388
80389
80390
80391
80392
80393
80394
80395
80396
80397
80398
80399
80400
80401
80402
80403
80404
80405
80406
80407
80408
80409
80410
80411
80412
80413
80414
80415
80416
80417
80418
80419
80420
80421
80422
80423
80424
80425
80426
80427
80428
80429
80430
80431
80432
80433
80434
80435
80436
80437
80438
80439
80440
80441
80442
80443
80444
80445
80446
80447
80448
80449
80450
80451
80452
80453
80454
80455
80456
80457
80458
80459
80460
80461
80462
80463
80464
80465
80466
80467
80468
80469
80470
80471
80472
80473
80474
80475
80476
80477
80478
80479
80480
80481
80482
80483
80484
80485
80486
80487
80488
80489
80490
80491
80492
80493
80494
80495
80496
80497
80498
80499
80500
80501
80502
80503
80504
80505
80506
80507
80508
80509
80510
80511
80512
80513
80514
80515
80516
80517
80518
80519
80520
80521
80522
80523
80524
80525
80526
80527
80528
80529
80530
80531
80532
80533
80534
80535
80536
80537
80538
80539
80540
80541
80542
80543
80544
80545
80546
80547
80548
80549
80550
80551
80552
80553
80554
80555
80556
80557
80558
80559
80560
80561
80562
80563
80564
80565
80566
80567
80568
80569
80570
80571
80572
80573
80574
80575
80576
80577
80578
80579
80580
80581
80582
80583
80584
80585
80586
80587
80588
80589
80590
80591
80592
80593
80594
80595
80596
80597
80598
80599
80600
80601
80602
80603
80604
80605
80606
80607
80608
80609
80610
80611
80612
80613
80614
80615
80616
80617
80618
80619
80620
80621
80622
80623
80624
80625
80626
80627
80628
80629
80630
80631
80632
80633
80634
80635
80636
80637
80638
80639
80640
80641
80642
80643
80644
80645
80646
80647
80648
80649
80650
80651
80652
80653
80654
80655
80656
80657
80658
80659
80660
80661
80662
80663
80664
80665
80666
80667
80668
80669
80670
80671
80672
80673
80674
80675
80676
80677
80678
80679
80680
80681
80682
80683
80684
80685
80686
80687
80688
80689
80690
80691
80692
80693
80694
80695
80696
80697
80698
80699
80700
80701
80702
80703
80704
80705
80706
80707
80708
80709
80710
80711
80712
80713
80714
80715
80716
80717
80718
80719
80720
80721
80722
80723
80724
80725
80726
80727
80728
80729
80730
80731
80732
80733
80734
80735
80736
80737
80738
80739
80740
80741
80742
80743
80744
80745
80746
80747
80748
80749
80750
80751
80752
80753
80754
80755
80756
80757
80758
80759
80760
80761
80762
80763
80764
80765
80766
80767
80768
80769
80770
80771
80772
80773
80774
80775
80776
80777
80778
80779
80780
80781
80782
80783
80784
80785
80786
80787
80788
80789
80790
80791
80792
80793
80794
80795
80796
80797
80798
80799
80800
80801
80802
80803
80804
80805
80806
80807
80808
80809
80810
80811
80812
80813
80814
80815
80816
80817
80818
80819
80820
80821
80822
80823
80824
80825
80826
80827
80828
80829
80830
80831
80832
80833
80834
80835
80836
80837
80838
80839
80840
80841
80842
80843
80844
80845
80846
80847
80848
80849
80850
80851
80852
80853
80854
80855
80856
80857
80858
80859
80860
80861
80862
80863
80864
80865
80866
80867
80868
80869
80870
80871
80872
80873
80874
80875
80876
80877
80878
80879
80880
80881
80882
80883
80884
80885
80886
80887
80888
80889
80890
80891
80892
80893
80894
80895
80896
80897
80898
80899
80900
80901
80902
80903
80904
80905
80906
80907
80908
80909
80910
80911
80912
80913
80914
80915
80916
80917
80918
80919
80920
80921
80922
80923
80924
80925
80926
80927
80928
80929
80930
80931
80932
80933
80934
80935
80936
80937
80938
80939
80940
80941
80942
80943
80944
80945
80946
80947
80948
80949
80950
80951
80952
80953
80954
80955
80956
80957
80958
80959
80960
80961
80962
80963
80964
80965
80966
80967
80968
80969
80970
80971
80972
80973
80974
80975
80976
80977
80978
80979
80980
80981
80982
80983
80984
80985
80986
80987
80988
80989
80990
80991
80992
80993
80994
80995
80996
80997
80998
80999
80100
80101
80102
80103
80104
80105
80106
80107
80108
80109
80110
8011

1 (PROCEEDINGS held via Zoom before The Honorable
2 ROBERT B. KUGLER at 2:00 p.m.)

3 THE COURT: I got a letter from Ms. Davidson
4 (Miller).

5 Ms. Davidson (Miller), what do you want me to call
6 you? I don't know what the parens is.

7 MS. DAVIDSON: Would you like an explanation, Your
8 Honor?

9 THE COURT: Sure, if you want to give me one. If you
10 don't, that's fine.

11 MS. DAVIDSON: I'm in the course of changing my last
12 name. And I just don't want people to be confused, so I was
13 just going to leave the old one for a while, for like a month,
14 during the transition period.

15 THE COURT: Okay. Fine.

16 MS. DAVIDSON: Great question.

17 | THE COURT: Fine, fine, fine.

18 All right. I got your letter. I'm not sure I
19 understand what the problem is. I mean, I understand you're
20 going to file the appeal on the class action. That's fine. I
21 mean, we'll see what the Third Circuit does.

22 If they disagree and say there shouldn't be any
23 classes, well, then I guess we send all the cases back to the
24 Panel, just go back to the various districts at that point as
25 individual cases.

1 But as I understand the trial that we've scheduled to
2 come up, there's three defendants and really one plaintiff, so
3 what is the issue here?

4 MS. DAVIDSON: Your Honor, the issue is that now that
5 a class has been certified, under the rules of one-way
6 intervention, a named plaintiff can't try a case outside the
7 class context. So the only class that can -- trial that can
8 go forward now would be a class trial. And a class trial
9 can't go forward until there's notice and opt-out.

10 So right now we're sort of prepping for a trial that
11 can't happen. And, for example, like damages, expert reports
12 are coming up, and the damages that we had instructed our
13 experts to respond to were, you know, MSP damages.

14 But now that there's a certified class, any trial
15 would involve the entire class, which is a whole different can
16 of worms in terms of damages reports.

17 So because we can no longer have a single plaintiff
18 trial in light of the class certification order, we sort of
19 feel stuck, and we have all these upcoming deadlines for a
20 trial that is no longer feasible.

21 The other problem, Your Honor, is that in order to
22 have a class trial, we would obviously have to have notice and
23 opt-out first. And realistically, that can't happen by June.

24 THE COURT: Well, I agree, we're not going to have a
25 class trial, but I've said all along we're not going to start

1 with class trials.

2 Who wants to speak for the plaintiffs?

3 MR. HONIK: Your Honor, I guess I can start.

4 I want to start by agreeing in some respects with
5 what defense counsel has said.

6 I think in view of Your Honor's ruling on our class
7 cert motion, that we have an obligation currently to submit to
8 Your Honor for review and approval a notice program and a
9 60-day opt-out period.

10 I think we also agree with them that one-way
11 intervention and pretty clear Third Circuit precedence
12 suggests that a trial going forward of any class member that
13 you've now certified -- and certainly MSP is not only a member
14 but identified as a class rep in your ruling -- needs to
15 proceed on a class-wide basis.

16 So I think it's well within your purview to manage
17 that in whatever way you think is most efficient, but the
18 reality is that I don't think we can proceed in June because
19 we need to give the now certified classes an opportunity to
20 obtain notice and opt out.

21 So I think we can stick with Your Honor's plan. I
22 just think at the least it needs to be deferred out into --
23 for sufficient time to have an opt-out period.

24 THE COURT: Well, we can't really manage that until
25 the appeals are filed and decided. Right?

1 MR. HONIK: I'm not sure that's entirely correct. I
2 don't know that the Third Circuit needs to weigh in
3 definitively on the 23(f) petition which have now been filed
4 as of last night.

5 I think certainly we can continue to prepare for a
6 trial. And in the absence of a direction from the Third
7 Circuit, I think it's appropriate to have a trial, a
8 class-wide trial.

9 THE COURT: But that's 60 days opt out -- so that's
10 at least 90 days away. Right?

11 MR. HONIK: I agree. I think -- we did some
12 calculating, and I think at the earliest, you know, we could
13 probably get a class trial ready, by about middle/end of
14 September.

15 MR. SLATER: And, Judge, I'll just add that --
16 because Rubin talked about the fact that you can manage the
17 class any way you want.

18 We certainly don't think that you need to try all of
19 these classes in one trial.

20 I read the 23(f) petition, and it seems to be getting
21 suggested that the plan is to have every single subclass in
22 one trial. We're certainly not asserting that. We certainly
23 believe that Your Honor could -- frankly, with the parties
24 that have already been identified -- structure a trial for the
25 claims that are within the purview of those -- that plaintiff

1 and those defendants utilizing the subclasses.

2 So we just want to make sure that we say that, that
3 we think you have a tremendous amount of discretion in how you
4 manage and deal with the class as you move forward.

5 MR. OSTFELD: Your Honor, Greg Ostfeld for
6 defendants.

7 I think I understand the suggestions from both
8 Mr. Honik and Mr. Slater, but we would respectfully disagree
9 both from the standpoint of efficiency and practicality.

10 From an efficiency standpoint, by the time notice
11 goes out, we'll probably know from the Third Circuit whether
12 they're taking the appeal or not. But there are -- obviously,
13 Your Honor ruled as you ruled, and you believe you got the
14 ruling right. And the Third Circuit will have an opportunity
15 to weigh in.

16 If the Third Circuit disagrees, an enormous amount of
17 time and energy could be expended on notice, preparing for
18 trial, taking the case for trial before there's any
19 opportunity -- or possibly to have to simply reinvent the
20 wheel afterwards.

21 Until notice goes out, there can't even be action on
22 things like dispositive motions because of the one-way
23 intervention problem, probably there can't be action on
24 Daubert motions because we don't know who's opting out yet.

25 And with respect to Mr. Slater's suggestion, the

1 problem I would note is a class representative can only try
2 its claims once.

3 So even if you limited this just to MSP, it would
4 have to try all of its claims in one trial, and it is the
5 representative for a series of TPP subclasses for which all of
6 the defendants, at least all the TPP trial defendants are --
7 excuse me, all of the TPP defendants are defendants. So it
8 couldn't just be the three defendants you're currently
9 contemplating for trial, it would need to be all of the
10 defendants that MSP is suing.

11 THE COURT: Okay.

12 MS. DAVIDSON: If I could just add, Your Honor, a few
13 points.

14 Adam, Mr. Slater talked about, you know, you could
15 just fashion this any way you can, but, I mean, the reality of
16 Rule 23 is that you certify a case, you're certifying it for
17 trial. And so the trial would have to include the entire TPP
18 class against all the defendants who the class was certified
19 against.

20 And the other thing I wanted to note, Your Honor, is
21 that the Third Circuit has recognized that, as you intimated
22 correctly, that you don't go forward with notice while a 23(f)
23 is pending. Right? Because then what happens? You give
24 notice to the class members -- and assuming review is granted,
25 then the notice has to be retracted.

1 So 23(f) does usually proceed more quickly than your
2 typical Third Circuit appeal. And it doesn't make any sense
3 to do notice until you know whether the Third Circuit is
4 granting the appeal or not -- granting the permission for
5 leave. Right? It's a two-step process.

6 MR. HONIK: Your Honor --

7 MS. DAVIDSON: I wasn't --

8 MR. HONIK: -- I'm unaware of such jurisprudence. I
9 don't say it's impossible. I'd certainly like to see such
10 evidence of that.

11 I think we've got an affirmative obligation to
12 undertake notice. I don't think we're permitted to sit on our
13 hands in view of the ruling. I think both the TPP and the
14 economic consumer classes as well as the medical monitoring
15 class members need to be apprised of the ruling, and there
16 needs to be a period to opt out.

17 And the very idea that this entire MDL litigation
18 should grind to a halt until the Third Circuit acts I think is
19 incorrect.

20 And I know from firsthand experience, I had a matter
21 that concluded just this past year in the First Circuit where
22 the First Circuit didn't act on a 23(f) for I think about 16
23 months.

24 And so the idea of this very mature litigation that
25 you've been managing for four years at this point, or almost,

1 grinding to a halt is just a preposterous proposal.

2 There are concerns about one-way intervention, but
3 that doesn't mean that Your Honor can't and shouldn't in this
4 roughly 90-day period where we will notice the classes, that
5 you can't entertain Daubert, that you can't entertain
6 dispositive motions, that you can't move the litigation
7 forward so that we don't have downtime.

8 I dare say the other thing we ought to do to address
9 the concerns of the defendants that there may be other
10 defendants implicated is to get them on board and have them
11 produce reports just like ZHP has done.

12 So we recognize the challenge, small C, that we may
13 be a couple months back in our schedule and not having the
14 desired June trial, but there's no reason on earth that we
15 can't have a September trial following an appropriate notice
16 period.

17 We've already begun to price out the program for
18 notice. It's not inexpensive, but it's not prohibitive. If
19 this were a settlement class and we had to direct notice based
20 on, you know, retailer information about consumers, that could
21 get expensive.

22 But we're prepared to trigger notice. We believe the
23 class deserves to be apprised of Your Honor's ruling. And I
24 think that we can make very effective use of these next
25 several months to get everything teed up so that when we get

1 past the opt-out period, we'll be in a position to try a case.

2 MS. DAVIDSON: Your Honor, if I may.

3 THE COURT: Hang on a minute. I have a question.

4 MS. DAVIDSON: Sure.

5 THE COURT: Do you agree with Ms. Davidson's
6 suggestion that what we're facing now, whatever it is -- let's
7 assume by your optimistic reasoning that somehow the Third
8 Circuit doesn't disturb anything and we're ready to go
9 sometime in September, this is going to be all plaintiffs and
10 defendants in the TPP matters at the same time?

11 MR. HONIK: I don't agree. I agree with what Adam
12 suggested, which is that now that we have a certified class,
13 and once we get past notice and an opt-out period, you have
14 multiple trial management tools at your disposal as an MDL
15 judge to try such fewer claims or fewer defendants as Your
16 Honor believes is appropriate. And there are I think
17 arguments on both sides to suggest that it should be bigger or
18 smaller.

19 We took some guidance from you, Judge, that I think
20 we wanted to take a smaller bite. And I think it's perfectly
21 within your purview to order a class trial, represented by MSP
22 in a courtroom, as to such trials as Your Honor thinks should
23 go.

24 So you had suggested and we agreed that it should be
25 all the claims brought by MSP, which is to say all the TPP

1 claims, the two warranty claims, the statutory, you know,
2 claims, unjust enrichment and the like. All of that can be
3 tried, and MSP can be in the courtroom representing the TPP
4 class, period. That can be managed very ably in a trial,
5 whether it's in September or October. That can absolutely be
6 done. And it would be proper for Your Honor to do that.

7 THE COURT: Ms. Davidson, go ahead.

8 MS. DAVIDSON: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor. A
9 couple things.

10 First of all, we have another named plaintiff, MADA,
11 so the Maine Automobile Dealers Association. It's unclear to
12 me if plaintiffs are trying to drop them as a named plaintiff,
13 but obviously they would be in the trial.

14 Secondly, Your Honor, the class was certified against
15 all defendants, so I really -- I understand that judges have
16 discretion with respect to trial management to some extent,
17 but it sounds like some sort of claim splitting they're
18 proposing.

19 The class was certified as to all defendants. It
20 wasn't separate certifications, so that is one class, and to
21 me it's one trial.

22 Also, Your Honor, court after court after court has
23 held that you don't issue class notice while 23(f) is pending.
24 When we file our motion for stay, I will include 10 to 15 case
25 cites to that effect. It is widely recognized that it's

1 wasteful, confusing, and risky. The Manual for Complex
2 Litigation says not to do it. So I'm just surprised to hear
3 plaintiffs saying that, because it is well established that
4 while a 23(f) petition is pending, courts do not issue notice.

5 And the last thing I want to say is that I believe
6 Mr. Honik said something about Your Honor entertaining Daubert
7 and MSJ rulings, but that cannot be done before notice and
8 opportunity to opt out, because the whole idea of one-way
9 intervention is class members can't sort of stand around and
10 see how the wind is blowing and then decide if they're in or
11 out. Like oh, there's Daubert rulings and there's MSJ
12 rulings, they're going one way or the other, that's going to
13 affect opt-out. The whole idea of one-way intervention is
14 like you're either in or out before you know which way the
15 wind is blowing in the court.

16 I don't know --

17 MR. HONIK: I completely agree with that, Judge.

18 MS. DAVIDSON: You interrupted me.

19 MR. HONIK: I suggested that it could be briefed,
20 that these matters could be briefed during this period. I'm
21 not suggesting the Court should rule. In fact, it should not
22 rule. It is a contravention of the one-way intervention rule.
23 But it doesn't mean that you can't order the parties to tee
24 the motions up so that they're briefed and available to Your
25 Honor so that you can rule on them before the trial.

1 The second point I would make, we're not trying to
2 dodge MADA's participation. If they are to be in the case,
3 that's fine, they can be in the case. Those are the two class
4 reps that you identified.

5 And to highlight a point that Adam made months and
6 months and months ago, suggesting that we ought to have a
7 sequence of trials, I think that's exactly what Your Honor
8 should do. I think trial one should be ZHP, and I think we
9 ought to get the other defendants in line directly behind them
10 with -- in the months running up to it, getting their damages
11 reports, their expert reports, just exactly as ZHP has done.

12 I don't disagree with the concept that with certified
13 classes against, quote, all defendants that they ought to get
14 in a queue. I only suggested it's well within your discretion
15 and management tool to try them sequentially. And that's
16 something that Adam and the plaintiffs had proposed months
17 ago.

18 MR. OSTFELD: Your Honor -- I'm sorry.

19 THE COURT: Hold on.

20 Ms. Davidson, you just mentioned you're going to make
21 a motion to stay.

22 Is that coming soon?

23 MS. DAVIDSON: Yes, Your Honor. Probably tomorrow or
24 Monday.

25 THE COURT: That's fine. That may be one way to tee

1 up these legal issues, by starting out with a motion to stay.

2 And you say you're going to cite all these cases as
3 to why I should not delve into cross-notice and all those
4 kinds of things at this stage. Right?

5 MS. DAVIDSON: Yes, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Well, why don't we do this then. If
7 you're going to file that in the next couple days, and I
8 assume the plaintiffs will respond with, I don't know, 10 days
9 or whatever you want to do.

10 We have scheduled already in court in April -- April
11 26th. Let's leave that on for in court. But I want to
12 make -- I'll make some decisions on where we're going from
13 here before then.

14 So defense will file the motion for the stay by the
15 27th of February. That's Monday.

16 You can do that?

17 MS. DAVIDSON: Yes, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Okay. Let's get a response from the
19 plaintiffs then by March 13th. That will give you two weeks.
20 Okay?

21 MR. HONIK: Yes, sir.

22 MR. SLATER: That works.

23 THE COURT: And then what we can do is how about
24 March 29th in court we'll discuss that -- those motions and
25 where we're going from there. Let's make it at 1:00 p.m.

1 Okay?

2 MR. HONIK: Yes.

3 THE COURT: And then we'll decide where we're going
4 from there once I have the chance to read your briefs.

5 MR. OSTFELD: Your Honor, respectfully, there are a
6 number of deadlines on the calendar that are coming up between
7 now and March 29th that could very well be affected by Your
8 Honor's determination with respect to a stay, including --
9 Daubert motions, damages report disclosures, dispositive
10 motions are all on the calendar.

11 Could those dates be held in abeyance pending the
12 March 29th ruling?

13 THE COURT: Yeah. We'll set new dates March 29th.

14 I've got to tell you, though, I'm not convinced that
15 we can't do Daubert. I understand the motions for summary
16 judgment, the one-way intervention problem and that, but
17 Daubert I don't think is in that category. But we'll decide
18 all that.

19 So let's decide all those things then March -- at the
20 end of March then, March 29th, as to what the new deadlines
21 are going to be, depending on where we go from there. Okay?

22 MR. SLATER: The only thing I would say, Judge, is --
23 and I was going to say it before you spoke -- we have no
24 problem with moving the deadline for some period on the
25 Daubert briefs which are due Monday, but I'm not sure that we

1 need to put them out that far, because I don't think that
2 filing the Daubert briefs treads on one-way intervention.

3 I just would like to make sure we at least get that
4 moving, because that's one piece that the parties are probably
5 pretty close to being done. Again, I have no problem moving
6 it few weeks. In fact, there's people on our team that have
7 said to me, if you can get us more time -- and I'm sure the
8 defense feels the same way -- nobody would weep. But I don't
9 know how everybody feels about that, to just move that
10 deadline a little bit.

11 THE COURT: What's your proposal?

12 MS. DAVIDSON: If I could respond to that, or --

13 THE COURT: Yeah, sure.

14 MS. DAVIDSON: So actually, our briefs are done, so I
15 think my paralegal would kill me for saying I don't think we
16 should file them.

17 But the concern I have is that with the certified
18 class, there are other defendants at stake, and I think they
19 should have a say into the Daubert briefing. I agree that
20 filing the briefs doesn't create a one-way intervention
21 problem, but I am concerned about the fact that we now have a
22 certified class and we have some defendants. And I can give
23 an example. For example, Mylan and other defendants who are
24 not in this trial as it was originally envisioned but are
25 defendants in the certified class and have very strong

1 feelings, as Your Honor may know, if you looked at the Third
2 Circuit filings, Mylan didn't even join our 23(f). Mylan and
3 Aurobindo did their own 23(f) petition because they have their
4 own issues that they want to raise. So that is my concern
5 about having Daubert motions at this point on behalf of just
6 three defendants.

7 I feel like as liaison counsel I have a duty to make
8 that point.

9 THE COURT: Well, unfortunately, they're not here at
10 the moment being represented, so we can't hear from them, but
11 I understand your point. And they do have some obligation to
12 let us know that they're concerned about this.

13 So, Mr. Slater, do you have a proposed list of when
14 you want to change these dates to?

15 MR. SLATER: I was going to propose to push it out a
16 couple weeks, the filing date of the Daubert.

17 THE COURT: I don't have a problem with that.

18 I mean, if, Ms. Davidson, you want to file what
19 you've got done, that's fine. You want to send that in,
20 that's fine. But if you want to give me proposed dates to
21 finish this up, that's fine. I'll listen.

22 MR. SLATER: I was going to offer March 13th --
23 that's actually the same date -- that's two weeks out, so --
24 that our opposition is due to the state motion, but I don't
25 think that will cause any problem, so we're fine with filing

1 our briefs then.

2 THE COURT: Okay. Sure.

3 MR. SLATER: Thank you, Judge. I appreciate that.

4 THE COURT: Yep. No problem.

5 Okay. A fine mess we're in, but we'll get it
6 straightened out.

7 MR. SLATER: This is the life we chose.

8 THE COURT: You'd rather be pitching baseballs, I'm
9 sure.

10 LAW CLERK: At the risk of, you know, asking
11 plaintiffs to do more, just a little more, could you please
12 send a letter clarifying what dates you are asking for from
13 this meeting. I know there will be a transcript, but it would
14 just be lovely --

15 MR. SLATER: Sure.

16 LAW CLERK: -- to have it on the docket.

17 MR. SLATER: No problem. The letter is going to say
18 March 13th for the initial briefs and then to just push out
19 the deadlines commensurate with what the deadlines already
20 were in terms of dates so that we don't have to figure --
21 we'll take a look and figure out what those dates are, and I
22 can put them right in a letter. Happy to do it.

23 LAW CLERK: Why don't you. Then maybe Judge Kugler
24 could issue a new or an amended case management order to make
25 it clear.

1 MR. SLATER: Will do. You'll have it today.

2 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Ostfeld?

3 MR. OSTFELD: Your Honor, I'm sorry, because I'm
4 afraid I may be confused at this point.

5 My understanding is it's -- the Daubert motions are
6 being pushed out, the other dates are being held in abeyance
7 until you rule on the motion to stay?

8 THE COURT: Well, unless somebody tells me there's
9 some other date that needs to be pushed out -- I mean, needs
10 to be met, yes.

11 MR. OSTFELD: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.

12 MR. SLATER: I can put that in the letter too if
13 that's helpful, just to confirm that that was the discussion.

14 THE COURT: Yep.

15 MR. HONIK: And Loretta, we'll confirm 2/27 for the
16 stay motion, 3/13 for plaintiff's response to the stay motion,
17 and 3/29 at 1:00 p.m. for an in-person audience with the Judge
18 in court.

19 LAW CLERK: Thank you.

20 THE COURT: That's it. Okay, everybody. Unless
21 there's something else, I'll let you go.

22 RESPONSE: Thank you, Your Honor.

23 MS. DAVIDSON: Thank you so much for seeing us on
24 such short notice, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: You're welcome. We're going to get it

1 figured out. Don't worry it. We'll get there, folks.

2 MR. SLATER: We always do, Judge. One way or the
3 other, you always get there.

4 THE COURT: Thank you. See you guys.

5 (Proceedings concluded at 2:25 p.m.)

6 - - -

7 I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript
8 from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

9

10 /S/ Ann Marie Mitchell, CCR, CRR, RDR, RMR
11 Court Reporter/Transcriber

12 24th day of February, 2023
13 Date

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

/	7	10:15, 11:16 approval [1] - 5:8 April [2] - 15:10 arguments [1] - 11:17 ARPS [1] - 2:2 asserting [1] - 6:22 Association [1] - 12:11 assume [2] - 11:7, 15:8 assuming [1] - 8:24 audience [1] - 20:17 Aurobindo [1] - 18:3 Automobile [1] - 12:11 available [1] - 13:24 Avenue [1] - 2:3	6:5, 6:18, 6:22, 9:9 certification [1] - 4:18 certifications [1] - 12:20 certified [12] - 4:5, 4:14, 5:13, 5:19, 8:18, 11:12, 12:14, 12:19, 14:12, 17:17, 17:22, 17:25 certify [2] - 8:16, 21:7 certifying [1] - 8:16 challenge [1] - 10:12 chance [1] - 16:4 change [1] - 18:14 changing [1] - 3:11 Chicago [1] - 2:8 chose [1] - 19:7 Circuit [15] - 3:21, 5:11, 6:2, 6:7, 7:11, 7:14, 7:16, 8:21, 9:2, 9:3, 9:18, 9:21, 9:22, 11:8, 18:2 cite [1] - 15:2 cites [1] - 12:25 CIVIL [1] - 1:3 claim [1] - 12:17 claims [8] - 6:25, 8:2, 8:4, 11:15, 11:25, 12:1, 12:2 clarifying [1] - 19:12 class [39] - 3:20, 4:5, 4:7, 4:8, 4:14, 4:15, 4:18, 4:22, 4:25, 5:1, 5:6, 5:12, 5:14, 5:15, 6:8, 6:13, 6:17, 7:4, 8:1, 8:18, 8:24, 9:15, 10:19, 10:23, 11:12, 11:21, 12:4, 12:14, 12:19, 12:20, 12:23, 13:9, 14:3, 17:18, 17:22, 17:25 class-wide [2] - 5:15, 6:8 classes [6] - 3:23, 5:19, 6:19, 9:14, 10:4, 14:13 clear [2] - 5:11, 19:25 CLERK [4] - 19:10, 19:16, 19:23, 20:19 Clerk [1] - 2:13 close [1] - 17:5 Cohen [1] - 1:7 coming [3] - 4:12, 14:22, 16:6 Commencing [1] - 1:9 commensurate [1] - 19:19 completely [1] - 13:17 Complex [1] - 13:1 computer [1] - 1:24
0	8	abeyance [2] - 16:11, 20:6 ably [1] - 12:4 above-entitled [1] - 21:8 absence [1] - 6:6 absolutely [1] - 12:5 act [1] - 9:22 Actavis [2] - 2:9, 2:10 ACTION [1] - 1:3 action [3] - 3:20, 7:21, 7:23 acts [1] - 9:18 Adam [4] - 8:14, 11:11, 14:5, 14:16 ADAM [1] - 1:14 add [2] - 6:15, 8:12 address [1] - 10:8 affect [1] - 13:13 affected [1] - 16:7 afraid [1] - 20:4 afterwards [1] - 7:20 ago [2] - 14:6, 14:17 agree [8] - 4:24, 5:10, 6:11, 11:5, 11:11, 13:17, 17:19 agreed [1] - 11:24 agreeing [1] - 5:4 ahead [1] - 12:7 aided [1] - 1:24 almost [1] - 9:25 ALSO [1] - 2:12 amended [1] - 19:24 amount [2] - 7:3, 7:16 Ann [1] - 21:10 ann [1] - 1:21 AnnMarie_Mitchell@njd.uscourts.gov [1] - 1:22 appeal [4] - 3:20, 7:12, 9:2, 9:4 appeals [1] - 5:25 appreciate [1] - 19:3 apprised [2] - 9:15, 10:23 appropriate [3] - 6:7,	baseballs [1] - 19:8 based [1] - 10:19 basis [1] - 5:15 begun [1] - 10:17 behalf [1] - 18:5 behind [1] - 14:9 believes [1] - 11:16 between [1] - 16:6 bigger [1] - 11:17 bit [1] - 17:10 bite [1] - 11:20 blowing [2] - 13:10, 13:15 board [1] - 10:10 briefed [3] - 13:19, 13:20, 13:24 briefing [1] - 17:19 briefs [7] - 16:4, 16:25, 17:2, 17:14, 17:20, 19:1, 19:18 brought [1] - 11:25 Bruey [1] - 2:14 Building [1] - 1:7
1	A	C	calculating [1] - 6:12 calendar [2] - 16:6, 16:10 Camden [1] - 1:8 cannot [1] - 13:7 case [8] - 4:6, 7:18, 8:16, 11:1, 12:24, 14:2, 14:3, 19:24 cases [3] - 3:23, 3:25, 15:2 category [1] - 16:17 CCR [1] - 21:10 cert [1] - 5:7 certainly [6] - 5:13,
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
60 [1] - 6:9 60-day [1] - 5:9 60601 [1] - 2:8			

<p>16:13, 18:14, 18:20, 19:12, 19:20, 19:21, 20:6</p> <p>Daubert [13] - 7:24, 10:5, 13:6, 13:11, 16:9, 16:15, 16:17, 16:25, 17:2, 17:19, 18:5, 18:16, 20:5</p> <p>dave [1] - 2:14</p> <p>DAVIDSON [17] - 2:3, 3:7, 3:11, 3:16, 4:4, 8:12, 9:7, 11:2, 11:4, 12:8, 13:18, 14:23, 15:5, 15:17, 17:12, 17:14, 20:23</p> <p>Davidson [5] - 3:3, 3:5, 12:7, 14:20, 18:18</p> <p>Davidson's [1] - 11:5</p> <p>days [4] - 6:9, 6:10, 15:7, 15:8</p> <p>DC [1] - 2:4</p> <p>deadline [2] - 16:24, 17:10</p> <p>deadlines [5] - 4:19, 16:6, 16:20, 19:19</p> <p>deal [1] - 7:4</p> <p>Dealers [1] - 12:11</p> <p>decide [4] - 13:10, 16:3, 16:17, 16:19</p> <p>decided [1] - 5:25</p> <p>decisions [1] - 15:12</p> <p>defendants [23] - 4:2, 7:1, 7:6, 8:6, 8:7, 8:8, 8:10, 8:18, 10:9, 10:10, 11:10, 11:15, 12:15, 12:19, 14:9, 14:13, 17:18, 17:22, 17:23, 17:25, 18:6</p> <p>Defendants [2] - 2:4, 2:9</p> <p>defense [3] - 5:5, 15:14, 17:8</p> <p>deferred [1] - 5:22</p> <p>definitively [1] - 6:3</p> <p>delve [1] - 15:3</p> <p>Deputy [1] - 2:14</p> <p>deserves [1] - 10:23</p> <p>desired [1] - 10:14</p> <p>determination [1] - 16:8</p> <p>different [1] - 4:15</p> <p>direct [1] - 10:19</p> <p>direction [1] - 6:6</p> <p>directly [1] - 14:9</p> <p>disagree [3] - 3:22, 7:8, 14:12</p> <p>disagrees [1] - 7:16</p> <p>disclosures [1] - 16:9</p> <p>discretion [3] - 7:3,</p>	<p>12:16, 14:14</p> <p>discuss [1] - 15:24</p> <p>discussion [1] - 20:13</p> <p>disposal [1] - 11:14</p> <p>dispositive [3] - 7:22, 10:6, 16:9</p> <p>DISTRICT [3] - 1:1, 1:1, 1:11</p> <p>districts [1] - 3:24</p> <p>disturb [1] - 11:8</p> <p>docket [1] - 19:16</p> <p>dodge [1] - 14:2</p> <p>done [7] - 10:11, 12:6, 13:7, 14:11, 17:5, 17:14, 18:19</p> <p>downtime [1] - 10:7</p> <p>Drive [1] - 2:8</p> <p>drop [1] - 12:12</p> <p>due [2] - 16:25, 18:24</p> <p>during [2] - 3:14, 13:20</p> <p>duty [1] - 18:7</p>	<p>experts [1] - 4:13</p> <p>explanation [1] - 3:7</p> <p>extent [1] - 12:16</p>	<p>F</p> <p>facing [1] - 11:6</p> <p>fact [4] - 6:16, 13:21, 17:6, 17:21</p> <p>far [1] - 17:1</p> <p>fashion [1] - 8:15</p> <p>feasible [1] - 4:20</p> <p>February [3] - 1:8, 15:15, 21:12</p> <p>feelings [1] - 18:1</p> <p>few [2] - 8:12, 17:6</p> <p>fewer [2] - 11:15</p> <p>figure [2] - 19:20, 19:21</p> <p>figured [1] - 21:1</p> <p>file [6] - 3:20, 12:24, 15:7, 15:14, 17:16, 18:18</p> <p>filed [2] - 5:25, 6:3</p> <p>filings [1] - 17:2, 17:20, 18:16, 18:25</p> <p>fine [13] - 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:20, 14:3, 14:25, 18:19, 18:20, 18:21, 18:25, 19:5</p> <p>finish [1] - 18:21</p> <p>first [2] - 4:23, 12:10</p> <p>First [2] - 9:21, 9:22</p> <p>firsthand [1] - 9:20</p> <p>FLOM [1] - 2:2</p> <p>folks [1] - 21:1</p> <p>following [1] - 10:15</p> <p>foregoing [1] - 21:7</p> <p>forward [6] - 4:8, 4:9, 5:12, 7:4, 8:22, 10:7</p> <p>four [1] - 9:25</p> <p>frankly [1] - 6:23</p> <p>FREEMAN [1] - 1:14</p>	<p>H</p> <p>halt [2] - 9:18, 10:1</p> <p>hands [1] - 9:13</p> <p>hang [1] - 11:3</p> <p>happy [1] - 19:22</p> <p>Healthcare [1] - 2:5</p> <p>hear [2] - 13:2, 18:10</p> <p>held [4] - 3:1, 12:23, 16:11, 20:6</p> <p>helpful [1] - 20:13</p> <p>highlight [1] - 14:5</p> <p>hold [1] - 14:19</p> <p>HONIK [13] - 1:17, 1:18, 5:3, 6:1, 6:11, 9:6, 9:8, 11:11, 13:17, 13:19, 15:21, 16:2, 20:15</p> <p>Honik [2] - 7:8, 13:6</p> <p>Honor [32] - 3:8, 4:4, 4:21, 5:3, 5:8, 6:23, 7:5, 7:13, 8:12, 8:20, 9:6, 10:3, 11:2, 11:16, 11:22, 12:6, 12:8, 12:14, 12:22, 13:6, 13:25, 14:7, 14:18, 14:23, 15:5, 15:17, 16:5, 18:1, 20:3, 20:11, 20:22, 20:24</p> <p>Honor's [4] - 5:6, 5:21, 10:23, 16:8</p> <p>Honorable [2] - 2:13, 3:1</p> <p>HONORABLE [1] - 1:10</p> <p>Huahai [1] - 2:5</p>
<p>E</p> <p>earliest [1] - 6:12</p> <p>earth [1] - 10:14</p> <p>economic [1] - 9:14</p> <p>effect [1] - 12:25</p> <p>effective [1] - 10:24</p> <p>efficiency [2] - 7:9, 7:10</p> <p>efficient [1] - 5:17</p> <p>Eisenhower [1] - 1:15</p> <p>either [1] - 13:14</p> <p>end [1] - 16:20</p> <p>energy [1] - 7:17</p> <p>enormous [1] - 7:16</p> <p>enrichment [1] - 12:2</p> <p>entertain [2] - 10:5</p> <p>entertaining [1] - 13:6</p> <p>entire [3] - 4:15, 8:17, 9:17</p> <p>entirely [1] - 6:1</p> <p>entitled [1] - 21:8</p> <p>envisioned [1] - 17:24</p> <p>ESQUIRE [5] - 1:14, 1:18, 2:3, 2:7, 2:13</p> <p>established [1] - 13:3</p> <p>evidence [1] - 9:10</p> <p>exactly [2] - 14:7, 14:11</p> <p>example [3] - 4:11, 17:23</p> <p>excuse [1] - 8:7</p> <p>expended [1] - 7:17</p> <p>expensive [1] - 10:21</p> <p>experience [1] - 9:20</p> <p>expert [2] - 4:11, 14:11</p>	<p>filings [1] - 18:2</p> <p>fine [13] - 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:20, 14:3, 14:25, 18:19, 18:20, 18:21, 18:25, 19:5</p> <p>finish [1] - 18:21</p> <p>first [2] - 4:23, 12:10</p> <p>First [2] - 9:21, 9:22</p> <p>firsthand [1] - 9:20</p> <p>FLOM [1] - 2:2</p> <p>folks [1] - 21:1</p> <p>following [1] - 10:15</p> <p>foregoing [1] - 21:7</p> <p>forward [6] - 4:8, 4:9, 5:12, 7:4, 8:22, 10:7</p> <p>four [1] - 9:25</p> <p>frankly [1] - 6:23</p> <p>FREEMAN [1] - 1:14</p>	<p>filed [2] - 5:25, 6:3</p> <p>filings [1] - 17:2, 17:20, 18:16, 18:25</p> <p>fine [13] - 3:10, 3:15, 3:17, 3:20, 14:3, 14:25, 18:19, 18:20, 18:21, 18:25, 19:5</p> <p>finish [1] - 18:21</p> <p>first [2] - 4:23, 12:10</p> <p>First [2] - 9:21, 9:22</p> <p>firsthand [1] - 9:20</p> <p>FLOM [1] - 2:2</p> <p>folks [1] - 21:1</p> <p>following [1] - 10:15</p> <p>foregoing [1] - 21:7</p> <p>forward [6] - 4:8, 4:9, 5:12, 7:4, 8:22, 10:7</p> <p>four [1] - 9:25</p> <p>frankly [1] - 6:23</p> <p>FREEMAN [1] - 1:14</p>	<p>I</p> <p>idea [4] - 9:17, 9:24, 13:8, 13:13</p> <p>identified [3] - 5:14, 6:24, 14:4</p> <p>Illinois [1] - 2:8</p> <p>implicated [1] - 10:10</p> <p>impossible [1] - 9:9</p> <p>in-person [1] - 20:17</p> <p>Inc [2] - 2:9, 2:10</p> <p>include [2] - 8:17, 12:24</p> <p>including [1] - 16:8</p> <p>incorrect [1] - 9:19</p> <p>individual [1] - 3:25</p> <p>Industries [1] - 2:9</p> <p>inexpensive [1] - 10:18</p> <p>information [1] - 10:20</p> <p>initial [1] - 19:18</p>	
<p>G</p> <p>granted [1] - 8:24</p> <p>granting [2] - 9:4</p> <p>great [1] - 3:16</p> <p>GREENBERG [1] - 2:7</p> <p>Greg [1] - 7:5</p> <p>GREGORY [1] - 2:7</p> <p>grind [1] - 9:18</p> <p>grinding [1] - 10:1</p> <p>guess [2] - 3:23, 5:3</p> <p>guidance [1] - 11:19</p> <p>guys [1] - 21:4</p>	<p>granted [1] - 8:24</p> <p>granting [2] - 9:4</p> <p>great [1] - 3:16</p> <p>GREENBERG [1] - 2:7</p> <p>Greg [1] - 7:5</p> <p>GREGORY [1] - 2:7</p> <p>grind [1] - 9:18</p> <p>grinding [1] - 10:1</p> <p>guess [2] - 3:23, 5:3</p> <p>guidance [1] - 11:19</p> <p>guys [1] - 21:4</p>	<p>granted [1] - 8:24</p> <p>granting [2] - 9:4</p> <p>great [1] - 3:16</p> <p>GREENBERG [1] - 2:7</p> <p>Greg [1] - 7:5</p> <p>GREGORY [1] - 2:7</p> <p>grind [1] - 9:18</p> <p>grinding [1] - 10:1</p> <p>guess [2] - 3:23, 5:3</p> <p>guidance [1] - 11:19</p> <p>guys [1] - 21:4</p>	<p>K</p> <p>KATZ [1] - 1:14</p> <p>kill [1] - 17:15</p> <p>kinds [1] - 15:4</p> <p>KUGLER [2] - 1:10, 3:2</p> <p>Kugler [2] - 2:13, 19:23</p> <p>L</p> <p>last [3] - 3:11, 6:4, 13:5</p> <p>LAW [4] - 19:10, 19:16, 19:23, 20:19</p> <p>Law [1] - 2:13</p> <p>least [4] - 5:22, 6:10, 8:6, 17:3</p> <p>leave [3] - 3:13, 9:5, 15:11</p> <p>legal [1] - 15:1</p> <p>letter [6] - 3:3, 3:18, 19:12, 19:17, 19:22, 20:12</p> <p>LIABILITY [1] - 1:4</p> <p>liaison [1] - 18:7</p> <p>life [1] - 19:7</p> <p>light [1] - 4:18</p>	

<p>limited [1] - 8:3 line [1] - 14:9 list [1] - 18:13 listen [1] - 18:21 litigation [3] - 9:17, 9:24, 10:6 LITIGATION [1] - 1:4 Litigation [1] - 13:2 LLC [4] - 1:14, 1:17, 2:5, 2:9 LLP [2] - 2:2, 2:7 look [1] - 19:21 looked [1] - 18:1 LORETTA [1] - 2:13 Loretta [1] - 20:15 lovely [1] - 19:14 Ltd [2] - 2:5, 2:9</p>	<p>Miller [1] - 3:4 minute [1] - 11:3 Mitchell [3] - 1:7, 1:21, 21:10 moment [1] - 18:10 Monday [3] - 14:24, 15:15, 16:25 monitoring [1] - 9:14 month [1] - 3:13 months [8] - 9:23, 10:13, 10:25, 14:5, 14:6, 14:10, 14:16 most [1] - 5:17 motion [9] - 5:7, 12:24, 14:21, 15:1, 15:14, 18:24, 20:7, 20:16 motions [10] - 7:22, 7:24, 10:6, 13:24, 15:24, 16:9, 16:10, 16:15, 18:5, 20:5 move [3] - 7:4, 10:6, 17:9 moving [3] - 16:24, 17:4, 17:5 MR [28] - 5:3, 6:1, 6:11, 6:15, 7:5, 9:6, 9:8, 11:11, 13:17, 13:19, 14:18, 15:21, 15:22, 16:2, 16:5, 16:22, 18:15, 18:22, 19:3, 19:7, 19:15, 19:17, 20:1, 20:3, 20:11, 20:12, 20:15, 21:2 MS [16] - 3:7, 3:11, 3:16, 4:4, 8:12, 9:7, 11:2, 11:4, 12:8, 13:18, 14:23, 15:5, 15:17, 17:12, 17:14, 20:23 MSJ [2] - 13:7, 13:11 MSP [7] - 4:13, 5:13, 8:3, 8:10, 11:21, 11:25, 12:3 multiple [1] - 11:14 Mylan [3] - 17:23, 18:2</p>	<p>19:24 New [3] - 1:8, 1:15, 2:3 next [2] - 10:24, 15:7 night [1] - 6:4 nobody [1] - 17:8 note [2] - 8:1, 8:20 notice [23] - 4:9, 4:22, 5:8, 5:20, 7:10, 7:17, 7:21, 8:22, 8:24, 8:25, 9:3, 9:12, 10:4, 10:15, 10:18, 10:19, 10:22, 11:13, 12:23, 13:4, 13:7, 15:3, 20:24 NUMBER [1] - 1:3 number [1] - 16:6</p>	<p>Ostfeld [2] - 7:5, 20:2 ought [4] - 10:8, 14:6, 14:9, 14:13 outside [1] - 4:6 own [2] - 18:3, 18:4</p>	<p>practicality [1] - 7:9 precedence [1] - 5:11 prepare [1] - 6:5 prepared [1] - 10:22 preparing [1] - 7:17 preposterous [1] - 10:1 prepping [1] - 4:10 PRESENT [1] - 2:12 pretty [2] - 5:11, 17:5 price [1] - 10:17 Princeton [1] - 2:4 problem [12] - 3:19, 4:21, 7:23, 8:1, 16:16, 16:24, 17:5, 17:21, 18:17, 18:25, 19:4, 19:17 proceed [3] - 5:15, 5:18, 9:1 proceedings [1] - 21:8 Proceedings [2] - 1:23, 21:5 PROCEEDINGS [1] - 3:1 process [1] - 9:5 produce [1] - 10:11 produced [1] - 1:24 PRODUCTS [1] - 1:4 program [2] - 5:8, 10:17 prohibitive [1] - 10:18 proper [1] - 12:6 proposal [2] - 10:1, 17:11 propose [1] - 18:15 proposed [3] - 14:16, 18:13, 18:20 proposing [1] - 12:18 purview [3] - 5:16, 6:25, 11:21 push [2] - 18:15, 19:18 pushed [2] - 20:6, 20:9 put [3] - 17:1, 19:22, 20:12</p>
<p>M</p> <p>MADA [1] - 12:10 MADA's [1] - 14:2 Maine [1] - 12:11 manage [4] - 5:16, 5:24, 6:16, 7:4 managed [1] - 12:4 management [4] - 11:14, 12:16, 14:15, 19:24 managing [1] - 9:25 Manual [1] - 13:1 March [10] - 15:19, 15:24, 16:7, 16:12, 16:13, 16:19, 16:20, 18:22, 19:18 Marie [2] - 1:21, 21:10 Market [1] - 1:18 matter [2] - 9:20, 21:8 matters [2] - 11:10, 13:20 mature [1] - 9:24 MAZIE [1] - 1:14 MDL [2] - 9:17, 11:14 MEAGHER [1] - 2:2 mean [7] - 3:19, 3:21, 8:15, 10:3, 13:23, 18:18, 20:9 mechanical [1] - 1:23 medical [1] - 9:14 meeting [1] - 19:13 member [2] - 5:12, 5:13 members [3] - 8:24, 9:15, 13:9 mentioned [1] - 14:20 mess [1] - 19:5 met [1] - 20:10 middle/end [1] - 6:13 MILLER [1] - 2:3 Miller [1] - 3:5</p>	<p>N</p> <p>N.W [1] - 2:3 name [1] - 3:12 named [3] - 4:6, 12:10, 12:12 need [5] - 5:19, 6:18, 8:9, 9:15, 17:1 needs [6] - 5:14, 5:22, 6:2, 9:16, 20:9 NEW [1] - 1:1 new [3] - 16:13, 16:20,</p>	<p>19:2 New [3] - 1:8, 1:15, 2:3 next [2] - 10:24, 15:7 night [1] - 6:4 nobody [1] - 17:8 note [2] - 8:1, 8:20 notice [23] - 4:9, 4:22, 5:8, 5:20, 7:10, 7:17, 7:21, 8:22, 8:24, 8:25, 9:3, 9:12, 10:4, 10:15, 10:18, 10:19, 10:22, 11:13, 12:23, 13:4, 13:7, 15:3, 20:24 NUMBER [1] - 1:3 number [1] - 16:6</p>	<p>Ostfeld [2] - 7:5, 20:2 ought [4] - 10:8, 14:6, 14:9, 14:13 outside [1] - 4:6 own [2] - 18:3, 18:4</p>	<p>practicality [1] - 7:9 precedence [1] - 5:11 prepare [1] - 6:5 prepared [1] - 10:22 preparing [1] - 7:17 preposterous [1] - 10:1 prepping [1] - 4:10 PRESENT [1] - 2:12 pretty [2] - 5:11, 17:5 price [1] - 10:17 Princeton [1] - 2:4 problem [12] - 3:19, 4:21, 7:23, 8:1, 16:16, 16:24, 17:5, 17:21, 18:17, 18:25, 19:4, 19:17 proceed [3] - 5:15, 5:18, 9:1 proceedings [1] - 21:8 Proceedings [2] - 1:23, 21:5 PROCEEDINGS [1] - 3:1 process [1] - 9:5 produce [1] - 10:11 produced [1] - 1:24 PRODUCTS [1] - 1:4 program [2] - 5:8, 10:17 prohibitive [1] - 10:18 proper [1] - 12:6 proposal [2] - 10:1, 17:11 propose [1] - 18:15 proposed [3] - 14:16, 18:13, 18:20 proposing [1] - 12:18 purview [3] - 5:16, 6:25, 11:21 push [2] - 18:15, 19:18 pushed [2] - 20:6, 20:9 put [3] - 17:1, 19:22, 20:12</p>
				<p>Q</p> <p>queue [1] - 14:14 quickly [1] - 9:1 quote [1] - 14:13</p>
				<p>R</p> <p>raise [1] - 18:4 rather [1] - 19:8 RDR [1] - 21:10 RE [1] - 1:4 read [2] - 6:20, 16:4</p>

ready [2] - 6:13, 11:8 realistically [1] - 4:23 reality [2] - 5:18, 8:15 really [3] - 4:2, 5:24, 12:15 reason [1] - 10:14 reasoning [1] - 11:7 recognize [1] - 10:12 recognized [2] - 8:21, 12:25 record [1] - 21:8 recorded [1] - 1:23 reinvent [1] - 7:19 rep [1] - 5:14 report [1] - 16:9 Reporter [1] - 1:21 Reporter/Transcriber [1] - 21:10 reports [5] - 4:11, 4:16, 10:11, 14:11 representative [2] - 8:1, 8:5 represented [2] - 11:21, 18:10 representing [1] - 12:3 reps [1] - 14:4 respect [3] - 7:25, 12:16, 16:8 respectfully [2] - 7:8, 16:5 respects [1] - 5:4 respond [3] - 4:13, 15:8, 17:12 response [2] - 15:18, 20:16 RESPONSE [1] - 20:22 retailer [1] - 10:20 retracted [1] - 8:25 review [2] - 5:8, 8:24 risk [1] - 19:10 risky [1] - 13:1 RMR [1] - 21:10 Robert [1] - 2:13 ROBERT [2] - 1:10, 3:2 Roseland [1] - 1:15 roughly [1] - 10:4 RUBEN [1] - 1:18 Rubin [1] - 6:16 rule [5] - 13:21, 13:22, 13:25, 20:7 Rule [1] - 8:16 ruled [2] - 7:13 rules [1] - 4:5 ruling [7] - 5:6, 5:14, 7:14, 9:13, 9:15,	10:23, 16:12 rulings [3] - 13:7, 13:11, 13:12 running [1] - 14:10	S schedule [1] - 10:13 scheduled [2] - 4:1, 15:10 second [1] - 14:1 secondly [1] - 12:14 see [4] - 3:21, 9:9, 13:10, 21:4 seeing [1] - 20:23 send [3] - 3:23, 18:19, 19:12 sense [1] - 9:2 separate [1] - 12:20 September [4] - 6:14, 10:15, 11:9, 12:5 sequence [1] - 14:7 sequentially [1] - 14:15 series [1] - 8:5 set [1] - 16:13 settlement [1] - 10:19 several [1] - 10:25 short [1] - 20:24 sides [1] - 11:17 simply [1] - 7:19 single [2] - 4:17, 6:21 sit [1] - 9:12 SKADDEN [1] - 2:2 SLATE [1] - 2:2 SLATER [14] - 1:14, 1:14, 6:15, 15:22, 16:22, 18:15, 18:22, 19:3, 19:7, 19:15, 19:17, 20:1, 20:12, 21:2 Slater [3] - 7:8, 8:14, 18:13 Slater's [1] - 7:25 small [1] - 10:12 smaller [2] - 11:18, 11:20 SMITH [1] - 2:13 Solco [1] - 2:5 sometime [1] - 11:9 soon [1] - 14:22 sorry [2] - 14:18, 20:3 sort [4] - 4:10, 4:18, 12:17, 13:9 sounds [1] - 12:17 splitting [1] - 12:17 stage [1] - 15:4 stake [1] - 17:18 stand [1] - 13:9 standpoint [2] - 7:9,	Third [13] - 3:21, 5:11, 6:2, 6:6, 7:11, 7:14, 7:16, 8:21, 9:2, 9:3, 9:18, 11:7, 18:1 three [3] - 4:2, 8:8, 18:6 today [1] - 20:1 tomorrow [1] - 14:23 took [1] - 11:19 tool [1] - 14:15 tools [1] - 11:14 TPP [8] - 8:5, 8:6, 8:7, 8:17, 9:13, 11:10, 11:25, 12:3 transcript [3] - 1:23, 19:13, 21:7 transcription [1] - 1:24 transition [1] - 3:14 TRAURIG [1] - 2:7 treads [1] - 17:2 tremendous [1] - 7:3 trial [36] - 4:1, 4:7, 4:8, 4:10, 4:14, 4:18, 4:20, 4:22, 4:25, 5:12, 6:6, 6:7, 6:8, 6:13, 6:19, 6:22, 6:24, 7:18, 8:4, 8:6, 8:9, 8:17, 10:14, 10:15, 11:14, 11:21, 12:4, 12:13, 12:16, 12:21, 13:25, 14:8, 17:24 trials [3] - 5:1, 11:22, 14:7 tried [1] - 12:3 trigger [1] - 10:22 try [7] - 4:6, 6:18, 8:1, 8:4, 11:1, 11:15, 14:15 trying [2] - 12:12, 14:1 two [5] - 9:5, 12:1, 14:3, 15:19, 18:23 two-step [1] - 9:5 typical [1] - 9:2	10:25, 13:24, 14:10, 15:1, 16:6, 18:21 upcoming [1] - 4:19 USA [1] - 2:9 utilizing [1] - 7:1
		V VALSARTAN [1] - 1:4 various [1] - 3:24 via [2] - 1:5, 3:1 view [2] - 5:6, 9:13		
		W Wacker [1] - 2:8 wants [1] - 5:2 warranty [1] - 12:1 Washington [1] - 2:4 wasteful [1] - 13:1 weeks [4] - 15:19, 17:6, 18:16, 18:23 weep [1] - 17:8 weigh [2] - 6:2, 7:15 welcome [1] - 20:25 West [1] - 2:8 wheel [1] - 7:20 whole [3] - 4:15, 13:8, 13:13 wide [2] - 5:15, 6:8 widely [1] - 12:25 wind [2] - 13:10, 13:15 works [1] - 15:22 worms [1] - 4:16 worry [1] - 21:1		
		Y year [1] - 9:21 years [1] - 9:25 York [1] - 2:3		
		Z Zhejiang [1] - 2:5 ZHP [3] - 10:11, 14:8, 14:11 Zoom [1] - 3:1 ZOOM [1] - 1:5		